Redmine - Defect #21181

Markdown Formatter incorrectly parses lists

2015-11-08 21:44 - Anonymous

Status:	Closed		**Start date:**	
Priority:	Normal		**Due date:**	
Assignee:			**% Done:**	0%
Category:	Text formatting		**Estimated time:**	0.00 hour
Target version:				
Resolution:	Fixed		**Affected version:**	3.1.1

Description

Originally I wanted to raise a bug about the markdown formatter wrongly interpreting a list sub item as code, because it ignored the double identation instead of single identation for code in lists.

But while building a proper example to reproduce the behavior easily I found that the whole list parsing (for both ordered and unordered lists) is borked.

While I would like to be able to provide exact directions to what exactly is wrong here, the more I played around with this, the more confused I got.

What I can tell for almost certain is that blank lines are at the core of this issue. Normally items should be wrapped in <p> tags when seperated by blank lines, but here (at least for unordered list items in ordered list items) instead the current ordered list is interpreted as ended and a new ordered list started.

I used the official syntax from https://daringfireball.net/projects/markdown/syntax#list *as reference, which describes behavior conflicting with what Redmine produces currently.*

Example Markup

```
1.  this is a list item with two child items.
    -  first child

    -  second child wrongly interpreted as code
1.   another item in the same list.
-  text wrongly interpreted as ordered list item

1. last item of the ordered list
```

Expected Output (taken form Marxico)

 correct.JPG

Output from Redmine's inbuilt Markup Parser

 wrong.JPG

Related issues:	
Related to Redmine - Feature #32424: CommonMark Markdown Text Formatting	**Closed**

History

#1 - 2018-03-21 12:27 - Martin von Wittich

Still reproducible on 3.4.2.

#2 - 2018-03-31 11:19 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File output.png added

- File expected_m.png added

#3 - 2018-03-31 11:19 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- Status changed from New to Needs feedback

#4 - 2018-03-31 11:29 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File deleted (output.png)

#5 - 2018-03-31 11:29 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File deleted (expected_m.png)

#6 - 2018-03-31 11:42 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File expected_m.png added

- Status changed from Needs feedback to Confirmed

The real issue here is that the "- text wrongly interpreted as ordered list item" is interpreted as ordered list item instead of unordered. I'm going to report this issue to the redcarpet gem team because is not generated by Redmine.

Regarding the "   - second child wrongly interpreted as code" it not quite an issue because of the blank line that precedes this line and the same behaviour is also on the marxico.
   expected_m.png

#7 - 2018-03-31 13:11 - Marius BĂLTEANU

Marius BALTEANU wrote:

> I'm going to report this issue to the redcarpet gem team because is not generated by Redmine.

https://github.com/vmg/redcarpet/issues/655

#8 - 2022-01-22 10:52 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File parse_lists.png added

- Status changed from Confirmed to Closed

- Resolution set to Fixed

The current Markdown implementation based on RedCarpet is deprecated, it is going to be dropped in the future versions and it will be replaced by the CommonMark Markdown (Github Flavoured) formatter that is available in Redmine 5.0.0 (#32424).

To fix this issue, you should migrate to the new engine which correctly parses the lists:
   parse_lists.png

#9 - 2022-01-22 10:52 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- Related to Feature #32424: CommonMark Markdown Text Formatting added

#10 - 2022-01-22 10:55 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File deleted (parse_lists.png)

#11 - 2022-01-22 10:56 - Marius BĂLTEANU

- File parse_lists.png added

Files

correct.JPG	20.3 KB	2015-11-08	Anonymous
wrong.JPG	25 KB	2015-11-08	Anonymous
expected_m.png	187 KB	2018-03-31	Marius BĂLTEANU
parse_lists.png	49.1 KB	2022-01-22	Marius BĂLTEANU